4 Customs Competency-Based Training Guidelines

INTRODUCTION

1. LEARNING AND DEVELOPMENT IN CUSTOMS: IMPLEMENTING A COMPETENCY-BASED SYSTEM
   1.1. Guidelines’ Objectives
   1.2. Driving Principles for Effective Customs Learning and Development

2. CUSTOMS TRAINING MANAGEMENT ENGINEERING
   2.1. Establish a Customs Training Policy
   2.2. Identify the Training Key Players’ Roles and Responsibilities
   2.3. Implement a Competency-Based Training Strategy

3. CREATING TRAINING: LEARNING DESIGN AND DYNAMIC TRAINING RESOURCES
   3.1. Training Organizational Models
   3.2. Training Physical and Material Resources
   3.3. Develop Quality Training Programmes
   3.4. Evaluate and Assess Training

4. NATIONAL CUSTOMS CURRICULA
   4.1. Career-Long Training Components
   4.2. Customs Curricula: National Practices

CONCLUSION

ANNEXES
INTRODUCTION

In order to remain responsive to the challenges of the 21st century, Customs administrations need, amongst others, to continuously assess correctly their organization's strategic needs and ever-evolving business process requirements in terms of core, operational, and management competencies. It is essential that they keep a specific focus on anticipating the emerging competencies. This will enable administrations to plan, develop and implement an efficient policy to equip each category of their workforce with the right skills, knowledge and behavioural capabilities corresponding to their roles, responsibilities and specific tasks.

Training, its processes and infrastructures are core instruments for Customs organizational performance.

The role of training is to support the organizational goals and ensure that the administration’s policies translate into effective operational activities. This becomes particularly critical considering the significant investments of Customs in new technologies and enhanced processes which would be inoperative without skilled and competent staff.

1. LEARNING AND DEVELOPMENT IN CUSTOMS: IMPLEMENTING A COMPETENCY-BASED SYSTEM

Training policy, procedures, structure, staff and activities are crucial strategic elements for any Customs administration. They are necessary elements in order to:

- Comply with the mission given by Government;
- Accurately apply international, regional and national standards for Customs and international trade;
- Provide the international trade community with an appropriate level of service;
- Protect society and the public effectively; and
- Deal with the challenges of a fast-changing environment.

Training is one of the organizational development solutions that Customs administrations must emphasize in order to meet both organizational and individual changing demands. Training should always have priority and requires a strategic commitment from Customs management.

Customs’ workforce development and training policy should be developed in an integrated way with the strategic stakeholders of the organization, both internally and externally, ensuring that national training is competency-based, promoting life-long learning (continuous learning and development) and innovative learning systems throughout the organization.

The importance of training to any administration cannot be over-emphasized. An accurate learning strategy and training system improves employee efficiency, effectiveness, uniformity, confidence and job satisfaction, whilst helping to achieve organizational goals.

1.1. Guidelines’ Objectives

This document aims to provide Members with guidance on how to integrate their National Training Centres and learning management to support their broader Customs strategic direction. It is also intended to illustrate modern, efficient learning concepts to be implemented within the national training structures to ensure their responsiveness to the administration’s organizational needs.

These guidelines are integrated in the Framework of Principles and Practices for Customs Professionalism. The development of this document fulfils one of the mandates given to the WCO Secretariat by the Capacity Building Committee to enhance People Development in Customs.

The guidelines’ practical pointers to Customs administrations are structured so they can review, implement and upgrade their learning management strategy and practices and implement a competency-based approach to training policy and design.

1 Annex 1: Study on Benefits of Training, WCA Regional Working Group on National Training, 2010
2 Its completion results from the update of the Training Package Development in Customs inserted in the WCO Capacity Building Development Compendium (Chapter 9: Human Resource Management and Leadership) and the wide collection of practices under the Interactive Map on People Development available on CLiKCi.
The guidelines have four overall objectives:

- To provide practical guidance and to assist those involved in Customs training and learning management;
- To help achieving organizational consistency in the way National Training Centres are established, and kept responsive to the organization’s strategic needs;
- To provide useful practices to review Customs national training planning, development, implementation, delivery and evaluation schemes; and
- To help raising global training standards among the World Customs Organization Membership.

These guidelines are based on the WCO expertise and experience, on the good practices collected from Customs administrations and on recognized international training standards from the private sector and Human Resources (HR) professionals.

They aim to assist Members to increase performance, control training costs and manage turnover by:

- Enhancing business culture, organizational values and drivers;
- Delivering and tracking essential training tied to compliance, regulatory, job role and profile, and on-boarding requirements;
- Delivering structured curricula and learning events by developing adapted and innovative learning methods; and
- Developing Customs learning communities (knowledge sharing and management through the CLiKC! People Development Interactive Map as the virtual portal complementing this document with a living repository of Customs practices).

Key elements which bring a qualitative establishment of a Customs training system include:

- Reflection of business needs on the training policy;
- Understanding and support to the training function by senior management as well as coordination between training management, senior management and related departments;
- Proactive understanding and knowledge of the competencies required by the staff including efficient and accurate needs analysis focusing on operating models;
- Sufficient investment and funds for national training;
- Establishment of a learning environment promoting quality training standards in both development and delivery and enabling trainers to be rigorous, but flexible, in supporting the specific trainees’ needs;
- More training flexibility to comply with the evolving operational needs and less theoretical training programs;
- More emphasis on developing strategic decision-making capacity than knowledge transfer;
- Better coordination with the broader international training environment such as with WCO Regional Training Centres (RTC), Universities etc.;
- Innovative and efficient evaluation and assessment strategy focused on performance;
- Fostered usage of technology in learning environments; and
- Increased learning opportunities and career-long development.

A well-designed national training system is centered on both the organizational and individual performance. The competency-based approach enables Customs administrations to proactively embrace results-based management applied to training and the promotion of a learning culture.

Its implementation enables Customs to evolve from an aged conception of training based on subject matters (where the focus is put on knowledge). The learning and development processes now define the pedagogy according to the actions that the Customs professional will have to perform after the training. Programmes, curricula and processes shall then be centered on the core and specific competencies which determine the Customs Profession.

1.2. Driving Principles for Effective Customs Learning and Development

Principle 1: Political Commitment

A strong political will is critical to allocate the proper resources to workforce development and to adopt an integrated HR policy including training.

Gaining and maintaining a high level of political support requires an institutional and systematic analysis of the benefits of training so that they can be expressed in quantifiable terms. An integrated HR and Training policy and process provides an efficient tool to do so as it establishes a clear link between competencies and organizational performance.

Training services must be part of the decision-making process at a strategic level as they are closely interacting with the HR services. This ensures that they are faithful to senior management’s vision and policy, whilst also creating desirable career opportunities in training to attract and retain competent and experienced trainers and training managers.
The executives of each Customs administration and the organization as a whole must recognize that training:

- Has a core role to play in organizational development;
- Influences human resources development and performance; and
- Enables the administration to improve its attractiveness and professional image.

Training is one of the core components of the organization’s overall strategy implementation, of the efficient dissemination of its values and of the development of an esprit de corps, and is instrumental to operationalize its leadership’s long-term vision, and to reach the organizational performance goals.

Principle 2: Organizational Adaptation and Performance Assessment

Training needs to be developed and delivered by targeting the development and maintenance of competencies, as the set of skills, knowledge, behaviours that are predictors of personal ability to meet the organizational needs.

Since 2008, the WCO PICARD Professional Standards (for operational and strategic Customs managers) have provided common development standards for the management level based on the required competencies to efficiently lead and manage Customs in the 21st century. They provided a basis to several initiatives.

The European Union (EU) Customs Competency Framework offers now the 28 EU members an agreed standardized set of core and specific Customs competencies. The Customs Administrations of Burkina Faso, the Gambia, Morocco and South Africa, for example, have as well adopted their own Competency Framework as the foundation for Customs in-house HR and training policies to establish adapted developmental and educational programs.

Principle 3: Career-Long Development and Individual Empowerment

Customs training policy needs to be based on life-long learning principles and needs to provide continuous developmental opportunities throughout an officer’s professional career.

Since 2008, the WCO PICARD Professional Standards (for operational and strategic Customs managers) have provided common development standards for the management level based on the required competencies to efficiently lead and manage Customs in the 21st century. They provided a basis to several initiatives.

The professional (Customs officer and training recipient) must be at the centre of the whole training system and learning management. A sound training program provides benefits and foster motivation where training is a key part of integrated career development.

Incentives for trainees and training relevance are capital. Developmental and training programmes are both designed to answer each job’s tasks, role, level as well as each individual’s profile in accordance with the expected career progression.

Principle 4: Innovation

Implementing innovation is fundamental to promote the cultural shift to a learning organization, is required to answer the complexity of Customs tasks and is key to attracting and retaining people. A wide range of innovative learning methods and tools is available and blending them in helps achieving a cost-effective, relevant and flexible training system and learning management.
The use of combined and innovative learning methods and technologies has helped organizations to improving performance, to responding faster to business change, to speeding up the application of learning at work and to improving staff engagement and talent management.

The implementation of social and collaborative learning and the wide dissemination of learning portals within organizations increasingly represent a competitive asset essential to move toward integrated intelligence and corporate knowledge management. Moreover in response to the evolving demographics and increasing use of technology, organizations are increasingly encouraging staff to adapt social media behaviours in order to promote collaborative problem-solving processes.

2. CUSTOMS TRAINING MANAGEMENT ENGINEERING

The overall Customs training system shall embed the competency-based approach. In order to ensure this is the case, the training engineering shall be adapted.

The training engineering is defined as the whole set gathering policies, tools and methods enabling to implement, in a coordinated and rigorous way, the design, organization, implementation and evaluation of the training actions.

In order to ensure a methodical establishment and maintenance of a training system, the training engineering can be divided into two pillars: the training management engineering, and the pedagogical engineering.

The training management engineering is made of all the components which enable to define a national Customs training policy, to implement it, to apply and to make a legal and regulatory framework evolve, to structure and manage the main human, financial and material resources, to ensure the training implementation as well as the performance assessment of the whole system.

The pedagogical engineering or learning design is centered on tools and methods aiming at designing, implementing and continuously maintaining the Training Frameworks or Standards attached to each job, the training programmes as well as the Teaching Guides which facilitate their implementation. The main purpose of the entire training engineering process is the implementation of the Training Framework and the constant improvement of the Training System.

In order to achieve those goals it is critical that both the training management engineering and the learning design processes benefit from a strong coordination for either ensuring the feasibility of the pedagogical engineering proposals or establishing a common decision-taking process on reform projects.

2.1. Establish a Customs Training Policy

The training policy is the expression of broad intentions, fundamental justifications, basic options, priorities and strategies of the Customs administration in the area of staff training. This policy determines how training activities are conducted and it is influenced by the beliefs and values of the Customs administration.

It is not necessary, and probably not feasible, to provide a comprehensive list of all the elements which may be included in a training policy. Customs administrations, can and indeed should, decide on what has to be enshrined in a policy and what can be left open to the discretion of the training administrators. However, a training policy should include the following basic elements:

Mission Statement

A mission statement is a concise statement of the fundamental purpose of the Training Centre. It must be written in very general terms and be no more than a few lines in length.

Values

Values are deeply held convictions about the standards of behaviour which are expected in given circumstances, or the fundamental aspirations of the Customs administration. Values give character to all the activities of the Customs administration, including its training programmes.

Principles

Principles are the rules which determine how the Training Centre should organize its activities in order to achieve its fundamental purpose in a manner consistent with the values and mission of the Customs administration.
**Accountability Framework**

This relates to the agreed distribution of the workload between all the training function’s stakeholders. This framework pinpoints the responsibilities involved in the various activities needed to support the training system.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder</th>
<th>Accountable for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Management</td>
<td>Sound investment in training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources/ Personnel unit in headquarters</td>
<td>Coordination Determination of national training priorities based on staff planning, performance gaps and competencies needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training function</td>
<td>Delivering efficient and cost effective training programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field managers</td>
<td>Co-ordination of training activities in each region/ department and ensuring that officers under their supervision receive the relevant training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Ownership of the Training**

The training policy should specify who is responsible for it, i.e. who issued it and who has authority to review it. The extent to which the training function can influence that policy should also be specified.

In addition, the Training policy identifies the training building blocks and their main elements.

The identification of training needs and the formulation of the policy and implementation strategies to handle those needs have proved to be an extremely important vehicle for providing the training vision which Customs managers need to have in order to address the training challenges.

However, this vision alone cannot deliver the training; it must be followed by other measures designed to facilitate the implementation of training plans.

The training system is therefore composed of various building blocks that must be developed following specific requirements.

**2.2. Identify the Training Key Players’ Roles and Responsibilities**

Any organization needs to have the right level of engagement toward personal and professional development opportunities and training to attract and retain talent. It has to acknowledge that the success of any training policy depends on adequate preparation from all the training key players alongside the roles and responsibilities clearly identified in a transparent strategic document such as a training charter.

The list of 3 key players detailed hereafter is not exhaustive, top managers and the direct trainees’ supervisors are also instrumental as identified earlier for the Accountability Framework.

**Training Managers**

The role of training is to support the delivery of organizational goals and ensure that the policies of the administration translate into effective operational activity. To achieve this, training managers must both be seen, and see themselves, as leaders within the organization.

The main tasks of training managers are to:

- Define the main stages and components of the training process;
- Differentiate between the various sources of training needs;
- Compile, analyze and manage those needs;
- Develop training plans and programmes;
- Plan and manage training resources and activities;
- Adopt accurate assessment methods for training and trainees;
- Create an evaluation system and manage the training results;
- Reach operational achievements and organizational outcomes; and
• Adopt a systematic approach in training design, with standardized teaching tools.

Accordingly, training managers must fully understand the requirements of the Customs administration. Like in Hong Kong, China Customs Administration, they must also develop or sustain appropriate relationships, both internally and externally, to ensure that this role is met.

Identifying strategic relationships with stakeholders with regard to training is essential for gaining a clear overview of the training division’s status within the administration and for drawing up development challenges and priorities.

Training managers should make a conscious effort to express training benefits in terms of facts and figures in order to convince decision-makers and, where needed, donors. This requires a robust evaluation scheme and an institutional and systematic analysis of the benefits of training so that they can be expressed in quantifiable terms.

Trainees at the Centre of the Organization’s Training System

To secure a sound training strategy and learning management which will provide individual as well as organizational motivation and benefits, the Customs officer (the training recipient) must be at the centre of the whole training system.

The individual may gain certification, a qualification, additional authority or delegations, skills, knowledge, responsibility or variety of work. Such benefits may lead to promotion or better remuneration, for example. The outcome of the entire process is therefore an improvement in organizational performance.

As part of the career-long development, training needs to target Customs officials from all levels and at all stages of their career: from recruitment to specialization, from acquisition of new competence to knowledge and skills update/refresh and experts development, as well as at the different steps of leadership and management development. The trainees’ active participation in the whole training process is vital to the quality of the training; not only during the training action but also from needs assessment to the evaluation of training outcomes.

The trainee should be given personal responsibility to participate in identifying training needs based on his/her job profile’s competencies and performance requirements, the organization’s planned training programmes and developmental sequences and transparent career mapping. The organization should promote an active learning culture by allowing the Customs officials to request for his/her training and developmental activities according to these elements.

The selection of trainees should be clarified by their profile examination, personal motivation, applicants’ current and expected job performance, nomination by their line-management or combination of these criteria.

The organization’s training charter shall clearly state that the trainees shall commit:

• To prepare properly for the training action (familiarizing oneself with the reference documents, carrying out the pre-assessment knowledge test and/or requisite preparatory work, etc.);

• To play an active role in the training and comply with the organizational instructions (keeping to the timetable, collaborative or group work, etc.);

• To use the knowledge gained in the course of the training and ensure that it is transferred within their unit to achieve the objectives initially set;

• To report back on the actions taken following the training, and of the results obtained in accordance with the set training evaluation process.

An appropriate follow-up to the training must be carried out to ensure that both the trainee and the administrations gain maximum benefit.

Trainers as One of the Essential Performance Drivers

The Customs environment makes it necessary to have specific knowledge and behavioural skills that are uniquely linked to the technical aspects of the various posts within a Customs administration. However, training in Customs should embrace a wider range of additional knowledge, skills and competencies, including leadership and management capabilities throughout the organization’s levels.

Significant emphasis must therefore be placed on training capacities so that all the staff members being part of the trainers’ pool develop and maintain in-depth expertise on their subject areas, benefit from sustainable programmes on developing training techniques and constantly monitor their topics’ implementation and stay updated of the practices in both the Trade and Customs’ environment.

A proactive policy concerning career and advancement opportunities for deserving officers, as well as other incentives, will benefit the whole structure by raising the status of training.

Various situations regarding the status of trainers can be found in Customs administrations: full-time trainers, and/or partial time staff depending on the organization’s training policy and the expertise areas. These different situations do have an impact on the policy applied to trainers.

1 See Annex 3: Identification of strategic relationship with main stakeholders

2 Selection criteria practices from AP Customs Administrations are gathered in the Asia Pacific Compendium on Training, p.17.
Selection criteria of trainers shall anyhow ensure that they demonstrate:

- Professional experience on the course subject;
- Sound knowledge and abilities for training; and
- Motivation.

The administrations will therefore have to support their trainers and selected trainers will have:

- To continuously demonstrate their abilities to pro-actively keep up-to-date their knowledge and skills in accordance with the actual situation;
- To attend local or overseas instructor courses to enhance their competency as trainers; and
- If permanent staff, to undergo annual short-term attachment programmes to relevant units, academic sessions, conferences, etc. in order to keep abreast of the latest operational skills, knowledge and developments at field.

Moreover the profile of the trainers or lecturers invited to share their knowledge and experience can be widely diverse from senior or middle operational level Customs officers, to academics from universities, and/or experts from other governmental organizations and private organizations, who participate in broadening the trainees’ exposure to Customs’ partners perspectives and for specific areas of expertise like auditing, accounting, international trade etc.

2.3. Implement a Competency-Based Training Strategy

The training strategy is aimed at translating the training policy into activities. Designing a tailored training strategy involves the adoption of a cyclical process in which engineering must be competency-based and focused on performance.

The implementation of the competency-based approach enables a remarkable shift from annual training plans towards a more flexible yet longer-term approach to comply more efficiently with the organizational needs. The Training process cycle then becomes proactive as well as forward-looking: whereas the future strategic needs are anticipated, the pluri-annual training plans are monitored and readjusted whenever necessary.

In 2014, the Office Burundais des Recettes (Burundi Revenue Office - OBR) has developed its training’s policy and strategy on a three-fold approach:

1- Identification of the Training Core Principles, namely the OBR’s Strategic Plan, its objectives, and values, a Competency-based approach, the integration of the training Policy within the HR Policy, and a result-based evaluation and management

2- Establishment of an OBR Training System General Framework, based on a SWOT Analysis, identifying the OBR training’s strategic pillars and the roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders

3- Development of the General Training Process and its operational activities, gathering the types of training activities within the training plan, the annual training cycle, the implementation plan, the communication plan, etc.

Other instrumental tools have been annexed: a Training Charter, a Training Management Committee, the Selection and Management of Trainers guidelines, and the Training Methods Framework.

General Principles

A strong strategic and operational planning is required as a starting point and foundations for sound, reliable infrastructures, efficient training development capacities answering both long-term and short-term needs.

Strategic and operational planning

Strategic planning of the Customs training should make it possible to identify:

- The strategic training objectives based on the competencies required to achieve the different organizational goals;
- The target groups and the anticipated results of each learning process;

1 Malaysia Customs Administration, and its National Training Centre AKMAL and short-term detachment programme on operational sites for permanent trainers.

2 Customs Administration of the Netherlands’ selection and monitoring process for competent operational Customs officers to be released as part-time trainers.
4. Customs Competency-Based Training Guidelines

The specific developmental sequences and appropriate combination of training events and teaching methods for the target groups;

- The infrastructures, equipment and materials required;
- The systems needed to evaluate the training; and
- All the training resources required.

The operational plans should identify per programme:

- The programme’s specific training objectives;
- The participants and the place and date/duration of training;
- The detailed resource requirements; and
- The responsibilities of each of the participants and the sections responsible for managing the training and implementing the programmes.

**Performance gaps and Competency needs**

The systematic and continuous analysis on existing employees’ capabilities and organizational demands for competencies, alongside the analysis of the implications of new and/or evolving operating models and environment, is crucial.

The need for training is usually established through an analysis of:

- The administration’s mission statement, including goals, values and priorities;
- Performance gaps in respect of current tasks; and
- Anticipated performance requirements in respect of future tasks.

The Competency needs analysis should be conducted both at the organizational and at the job levels.

Ensuring that the whole competency needs analysis process focuses on the Administration’s reengineered business operating models, processes and procedures, it articulates Strategic and Operational Analysis looking closely at the specific Workforce development and Strategy requirements. The Training needs are determined based on the Competency Needs Analysis and the Performance Gaps.

---


Strategic Analysis

The strategic analysis focuses on the role of the Customs service, the organization’s priorities, the stakeholders’ expectations, and the organization’s structure. Elements like the strategic patterns of the organization’s recruitment policy, the evolving or emerging processes, tools, technologies leading to new or extended roles within the organizations, the enterprise architecture and organization size as well as the innovation in skills, knowledge and even behaviours shall be closely considered. The analysis of all these elements being owned by the HR department, it enhances the necessity for Training to be closely integrated with HR management.

Job analysis

The definition of the competencies required for the present tasks are often identified combining the implementation of the organization’s Competency Framework and an individual assessment process involving line managers in identifying the competency gaps against the job profiles. Several methods can be used at this level such as questionnaires and interviews.

Key points and tips

The following should be kept in mind:

- It is very difficult to estimate training requirements if not implementing a transparent and systematic competency-based approach. Expressed needs are often either exaggerated or not consistent with real needs;

- Training is often only part of the solution to performance problems. Performance problems may be caused by deficiencies in the training process or by other deficiencies in the environment. A distinction should be made while identifying performance problems, symptoms, and their causes which could be a wide combination of:
  - lack of skill or knowledge;
  - lack of opportunity to perform task/s;
  - lack of incentive to perform;
  - lack of motivation; and
  - other obstacles to good performance.

- The needs analysis should ensure that non-training related problems are referred to management for solutions.

Organizational adaptation, anticipation, flexibility highlight the need for the Competency Needs analysis to be a continuous and open process through efficient coordination mechanisms with the HR management first but also with the organization’s senior executive management, the operating services and experts, the line management (being tasked to play a full role in constantly identifying the competencies requirements of their team against their job profiles: roles, tasks and level of proficiency), and the external stakeholders.

It is also critical to promote a forward-thinking structure focused on the future requirements for competencies. The establishment of a R&D unit should be considered to monitor the legal, technological, operational and managerial Customs context as well as its business environment, to review and benchmark the situation in other organizations, and to develop research with in-house expertise and through strong relationships with Academia, Research Institutes and partners to anticipate the strategic decisions impacting the organization’s competency needs.

Methodology and Processes: the Training Framework as the Fundamental tool

As an efficient interface between the jobs and the training system, the competency-based approach provides transparent tools and processes as well as measurable evaluation criteria.

The competency-based approach is based on three pivotal pillars.

- First, the identification and integration of the jobs specifics, both at the organizational and operational levels such as the description of the job characteristics and the competencies required to perform it;

- Secondly, the development of teaching and learning material comprising the Training Framework, the Evaluation Framework and all the documents aiming at ensuring training standards and supporting its local implementation (pedagogical guidelines, etc.);

- Thirdly, the implementation, within each training center, of a teaching approach centered on each learner’s capacity to implement the competencies within the frame of his/her job/activity.

Therefore the competency-based training implementation revolves around clear components and tools which must be developed to ensure an effective and efficient Training Strategy.

In order to focus on the jobs’ specifics both at the organizational and operational levels, the training managers need to refer to key HR documents and processes:

- the organization’s Staff planning (providing them with an understanding of the macro context and its analysis);

- the Job & Competency Framework, including the Competency Dictionary (with the behavioral indicators) and the competencies’ Proficiency levels for each job; and

- a close collaboration with practitioners, both the training target audience and its direct supervisors, to understand the practical performance requirements of the jobs.

Based on this environmental scan and job analysis, the Training managers need to supervise the development of

---

1 Stakeholders are people or organizations having an interest in Customs activities (e.g. Customs brokers, trade and transport communities, other Government departments, etc.).
Implement a Competency-Based Training Strategy: The Methodological Process

- Contribute to his/her development, raising his/her autonomy level, empowering individual development and consolidation of professional competencies.

**CLiKC! Examples:** NZCS Training Framework; CBSA Training Standards for Specific Positions, HMRC on-line Professional Qualifications Catalogue, Swiss Competence Cardset.

The Training Framework offers a Training scenario translating Competencies into Training components.

The Training Frameworks (or Training Standards) are developed for specific functions or jobs. Based on the job analysis and the required competencies, they list all the training requirements and opportunities offered by the organization in a sequenced way. Within the CBSA, they “define the training necessary for a particular community to effectively perform their functions and guide the potential future course development by identifying training gaps and needs”.

A difference can be made between core training which is the basic training necessary to perform required minimum level of competencies for a current core job function, and enhanced training identifying the additional, specialized or advanced training necessary to perform current and/or additional duties.

They consist of a multi-purpose document used differently by the different actors.

For the Training Management, once developed, they lay the foundations of the Training delivery and design plans. For the Strategic Management, they offer a clear description of the activities which needs support for implementation. For the Managers and direct supervisors, they offer guidance to ensure that staff are adequately trained and developed, and that they identify their individual training needs for future steps.
New Zealand Customs Service: Mapping Customs Leadership Career Path, a Learning and Development Framework

The Training Frameworks offer a transparent guide to ensure they meet the necessary resources, financial, human, and material, can be easily mobilized for its implementation.

Whereas the Training Frameworks are prescriptive and widely accessible throughout the organization, the other Guides and Framework have a more specific use. These documents represent the main assistance tools for the training staff and related managers, as they gather for each targeted job all the necessary information for training set-up, logistics and delivery.

The Teaching Guide ensures that the trainers and the teaching team benefit from an adapted tool to implement the training scenarios.

The learning outcomes are specified, further sequenced and the learning methods selected and blended accordingly.

This ensures organizational consistency within the implementation schemes and yet some flexibility. It contributes to consolidating the impact on performance through consistent pedagogical approaches.
The competency-based approach applied to the Teaching Guide development stresses three elements:

- Actively building competencies through a progressive approach where learning and experimentation alternate;
- Centering the teaching process on the trainee providing him/her the clear perception of the meaning and impact of the competencies; and
- Contextualizing the training by all means.

The Teaching Guide aims at providing a teaching and pedagogical planning framework to identify the responsibilities amongst trainers, instructional designers, and heads of training infrastructures.

The document proposes several elements:

- The Training Framework content;
- The detailed flow chart of the Competencies acquisition sequence;
- The detailed time plan to deliver the training activities;
- The teaching principles and educational plan;

The learning elements, references, proficiency levels, the learning objectives and outcomes, as well as the teaching and learning activities per competency;

The evaluation strategies per competency.

The Teaching Guide presents for each training scenario a clear articulation on how the competencies are translated into behavioural performance indicators and activities. For each competency, the following can be presented:
From the Competency Framework, identify the critical and significant learning elements which will ensure the completion of the related task. Indicators on the knowledge scope. Indicators on the expected behaviours related to the targeted task. Most efficient activities taking into account the competence nature (plenary/group/individual activities).

The basic rules to identify the teaching/learning activities are to be relevant to the expected performance, to be feasible (based on the organization’s resources and values), to be diverse, and alternating.

The Evaluation Framework defines the evaluation strategy adopted to ensure that the training scenario will meet its performance raising objectives.

Based on the Training Framework elements regarding performance, it gathers:

- The evaluation strategies per competency (on both a learning perspective and for sanction);
- The indicators and evaluation criteria;
- The descriptions of tests and evaluation questionnaires.

The Evaluation Framework promotes the learner’s engagement and ownership of the impact the training activities will have on his/her work environment.

It can be associated for a maximized impact with a Personal Learning Plan. Several administrations, like the Canada Border Service Agency or the New Zealand Customs Service, have implemented this tool which enables an open and documented dialogue between each employee and the direct supervisor on his/her individual learning and development objectives. The tool and associated process ensure that the employee’s professional and personal development needs meets the organization’s performance development requirements. Carefully identified learning and development action plans directly impact on both the career development of the individual and the unit/service/department’s performance and the organization’s overall performance.

Frequent interviews, focusing on training and career development and following specific guidelines and pre-determined format, identify the appropriate developmental opportunities, and, based on the review of the individual targeted performance objectives as well as his/her career aspirations, the planning and prioritization of the actions to be taken. Thanks to the Job and Competency Frameworks and the Training Frameworks, the employee and supervisor can identify easily the training or development opportunities which are job-related (based on the current job description and performance objectives), those which are linked to the job development (mobility within a job family/stream), and those enabling to prepare a career development plan (on a longer-term basis with both horizontal and vertical career aspirations).

The Organization Guide develops the final practical implementation plan for each training scenario.

The Organization Guide translates the training scenarios, based on the Teaching Guides, and articulates the teaching organization and the physical and material organization requirements.

The Organization Guide identifies the human resources and details the trainers and support staff needs. It gathers relevant data for the staff selection, training, and development, as well as the tasks allocations between the personnel. The Organization Guide contributes to identify the competency profiles and the number of the trainers necessary for the training scenario.

The physical and material resources needs are also determined by the Organization Guide. For the material resources, it is suggested to assess systematically the needs attached to each competency, to identify for each competency the list of necessary tools (even if redundant between the competencies), once the detailed list completed to add any additional elements which would be an enabler or of cross-usage, and to identify the number necessary for the implementation of the related Teaching Guide. The physical plan is identified listing all the elements of the necessary plant(s) with their occupancy rates.

It is essential that the Training management considers the best possible use of the teaching and physical resources as several training scenarios will be implemented at the same time, and hence ensures training cost-effectiveness, optimal usage of existing resources, and continuous support from the organization’s management.

A competency-based Training Engineering requires developing these different tools around the Training Framework, but in a constant process of adaptation, revision of the scenarios in a view to optimize the adopted methods and to keep the Training Strategy pro-active and efficient.
The competency-based approach applied to Training revolves around the jobs characteristics, the performance requirements, both organizational and individual, and is highly interconnected with the HR policy.

Several elements are to be kept in mind at every steps of the Training Strategy establishment:

• The general context (as identified in the staff planning);
• Each job’s specific situation (analyzing the work situation);
• The required competencies’ formulation taking into account the context of each job (in relation with the Job and Competency Framework);
• The establishment of teaching facilities based on the professional environment’s example;
• The identification of the performance goals, and the methods to evaluate impact.

In order to implement such an approach, a Customs Administration willing to review, adjust and modernize its Training Strategy is required to set some implementation steps:

1. Develop Training and Evaluation Frameworks based on the competencies necessary to perform the targeted jobs’ tasks.
2. Conceive and disseminate Teaching Guides and Organization Guides
3. Allocate facilities, premises and equipment, enabling to create a teaching environment similar to the workplace or to have a direct access to the professional environment.
4. Set up various training and development actions for the training centers’ staff
5. Set strong collaboration mechanisms with the workplace and professionals (jobs analysis involving management and subordinates, internships, apprenticeship, job-study alternation, etc.)

The following elements detail the practical methodology to implement these steps. The models and practices presented can be used to develop the different processes, Frameworks and Guides.

3. CREATING TRAINING: LEARNING DESIGN AND DYNAMIC TRAINING RESOURCES

This part is structured around three critical elements:

• The necessity of adapting the Training Centre’s organizational model to the administration’s strategic needs and training policy;
• The elements tied to resources, both human, physical and material such as building, equipment and services; and
• The description of the pedagogical process’s different steps related to the conception, design and delivery of training activities.

These elements aim at strengthening the Customs Administrations with various methods, models and practices in order to operationalize the Training Strategy, equip the organization with the necessary resources to develop the Training Frameworks, Evaluations Framework, Teaching Guide and Organization Guide.

3.1. Training Organizational Models

Whereas the strategic status of Training requires strong political will and visibility in the decision-making process, a wide range of practices can be identified regarding the hierarchical position and level of autonomy of the different Training Departments/Services/Directorates throughout the WCO Membership, and their level of integration within the Human Resources Management policy.

Depending of the overall enterprise architecture, values and history of the organization, some Training teams and institutions operate under the oversight of their organization’s HR department, others benefit from an autonomous status directly reporting to the highest management level.

Independently from the organizational chart models, the competency-based approach requires an integrated scheme, and strong coordination between HR and Training as the HR processes provide Training with foundations’ tools.

The collected practices amongst the Customs Community present a wide scope of different organizational chart models (Eastern Africa Community, Japan, etc.).

Some other practices show that a same department can combine Training and Staff Development Management.

When considering more closely the different practices touching upon the Training departments’ internal organizational charts, various conclusions can be drawn.

Amongst the shared Members’ practices and even if each organizational chart is specific to a given administration, some common elements have been identified as commonly implemented to provide the Training structure with the adapted organizational framework in order to efficiently meet its objectives.

Three core components are widely identified as the traditional elements to ensure the national training structures comply with their mandate. They are very variously developed and articulated but gather the main responsibilities of a training structure.
• The management, as a plural body ensuring the organizational strategic alignment, planning, coordination and supervision, and reporting on the Training resources and activities;

• The administration, mainly dealing with personal and administrative issues, budget, maintenance of facility etc.;

• The department in charge of Training Development and Delivery responsible for the operational planning of all training activities, managing trainers, mentors, and course developers, developing and maintaining the curricula, and developmental programmes, etc.; and

• Research and Development Department, dealing with strategic needs analysis and planning, evaluation and assessment of training performance, research and promotion of innovation in training to continuously foster the organizational compliance, development of partnerships with Academia, etc.

In some administrations like the Korea Customs Service, the Canine Training Section completes the chart.

It is to be noted that some distinctive trends and patterns have also contributed to modify some of the Customs Administrations’ Training structures organizational models in the last few years. The raise of innovative and collaborative learning methods, the increased analytical and strategic capabilities of the Customs workforce represent a progressive cultural shift which has an impact with:

• The enhanced use of communication and social media to promote corporate knowledge sharing; and

• The increased need for the staff to have access to a robust set of data and analysis on their professional environment based on a state-of-the-art research activity.

3.2. Training Physical and Material Resources

The elements identified here are to be addressed in order to enable efficient Organization Guides development and pedagogical engineering. The strategic alignment of the equipment and infrastructures with the operating models, the required competencies and the organization values is essential. Based on the specificities of the Customs Profession, the good practices are showing diverse situations but consistency in terms of the importance given to multi-modal pedagogical environments simulating the practical and operational implementation within the professional context as well as the development of problem-solving and creative thinking competencies.

Training Structures

There is a wide spectrum of situations in Customs administrations regarding training structures. Some have one central National Training Centre, which operates and coordinates all training activities gathering in-house trainers, researchers and other officers. Some have small-size temporary based structures and part-time trainers which bring flexibility and reduce costs. It should be noted that an administration might have one or several Training Centres depending on the organization’s policy, resources and specifications.
4. Customs Competency-Based Training Guidelines

The situation is diverse among the Customs Community: some administrations are considering building a training centre, others do not have any permanent training structure and either share or rent physical locations (often with other law enforcement agencies), or even use operations facilities. Others do have a tradition of having a Customs School, Institute or Academy, with different levels of autonomy. It is nevertheless vital that the adopted solution is and remains fully compliant with the strategic needs of the administration.

The Canada Border Services Agency has fully redesigned its College in order to comply with the new border policy aiming its officers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Centralized National Training Centre</th>
<th>Regional Training Offices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pros</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish a focal point for training (ease of activities and resources coordination, visibility)</td>
<td>There is no need of big capital investment; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allow higher quality of equipment;</td>
<td>Minimize work interruption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greatly enhance harmonization among Customs officials;</td>
<td>Training reactivity to local needs (specific needs identified by local management, refreshing knowledge or introducing new procedures, legislation, etc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carry-out quality control conveniently;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieve standardization of training;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitor training easily and cheaply; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhance the corporate identity and esprit de corps.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cons</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requires heavy capital investment;</td>
<td>More coordination cost;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating costs can also be high due to the movement of both trainees and trainers; and</td>
<td>Maintaining same standards in training centres may be difficult; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The numbers to be trained at any one time may be too many and overwhelm the centre.</td>
<td>Lack of harmonizing of the officials in the training program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Either centralized or decentralized training schemes (either on-the-job, mobile, virtual, regional, national, or international), the different options demonstrate some important training strategy choices impacting the organization's culture, cost-effectiveness and responsiveness towards the competencies needs.

Based on the Asia-Pacific Compendium on Training and other collected practices, a table of pros and cons related to the Training offices' physical location (centralization vs. regionalization) can be designed (see hereabove).

**Decentralization and Specialization**

Some training facilities might be specialized in a specific kind of training, based on the target audience’s level (e.g. induction courses/initial training, Management Centre) or specialization (enforcement training, etc.). Some administrations might prefer to operate with regional training centres, which offer training opportunities by regions or to the whole territory, and play a different role to that of the National Centre.

Developing new training facilities or upgrading existing ones is an important decision and must be sanctioned and supported at the administration’s highest decision-making levels. Approval of such a decision triggers a step-by-step implementation process which should involve the following stages:

**Training Centre Implementation Process**

The following section focuses on the different elements needed to set up a Training Centre. Each element might, however, be used when considering the review and upgrade of an existing infrastructure.
### Step 1: Appointment of a Steering Committee

**Composition**

The conception, design, planning and other processes leading to the eventual construction of a Training Centre represent a complex task. This task is usually undertaken by a Steering Committee comprising experts in relevant fields (representatives from the Director General’s office, field offices, the accounting department, HR and Training services, officials who are affected by the project, and even experts from other organizations to provide different perspectives, etc.). It is imperative that the Head (or prospective Head) of the Training Centre be a member of the Committee.

**Terms of Reference**

The Steering Committee should be provided with enough resources, and given sufficient authority to make decisions on matters within its terms of reference. It then should define its own working methods and strategies before embarking on the task. This should include planning the execution of the various tasks and agreeing on the criteria for evaluating the outcome of each task.

### Step 2: Consultation of long-range forecasts of training requirements

**Factors affecting training demand**

The demand for training is not static. It fluctuates with changes in the internal and external environment in which the administration operates. Some of the factors which influence training demand are both external factors (change in legislation, technology, regional agreements, etc.) and internal factors (change in organizational structure, policies, human resources structure, etc.). These long-range training forecasts, such as human resources audit, supply and demand forecasts, must be a systematic process led by Human Resources Development management. It is then possible to establish a training workload plan.

### Step 3: Determination of the facilities required

**Determination of the scope and level of utilization of the facility**

An initial utilization level (number of trainees attending courses in one year expressed as a percentage of the total annual trainee capacity of the facility) of a 60-80% is usually recommended but depends on the HR forecasts.

**Determination of specific requirements**

An evaluation of the facilities which already exist must first be completed: SWOT analysis, characteristics and capacities. An accurate determination of additional requirements is then possible.

This stage involves a detailed breakdown of the space required as follows:

- **Types of Training space:**
  
  | Flexible and fully-connected, multimedia classrooms, lecture rooms, amphitheatre | Special-purpose rooms (trainers’ meeting room, relaxation/study/ syndicate rooms, prayer rooms, etc.) | Laboratories |
  | Simulated work environments (search bays, etc.) | Learning resources centre (library, research) | Auditorium/conference service |
  | Indoor shooting range/sport facilities (if applicable) | Storage room for samples for Harmonized System classification training | IT and computer rooms |

- Living space: bedrooms/dormitories, caretaker accommodation, lounges, dining space, lavatories, medical services, utilities, parking space, kitchen space, small works room, trainers (including guest trainers), course developers, administrators, support personnel, contract services, etc.

- Other space required for: storages, assembly and shipping of training materials, printing and reproduction, computer operations, multimedia studio, registration and trainee support, equipment maintenance, reception area, central files, multi-purpose/convertible sports facility, security, etc.
### Step 4: Development of options

**Review of the options**

Development of training facilities involves a considerable outlay of resources. Once taken, decisions are difficult and/or expensive to alter, so the best decision must be made from the outset. For this to be possible, the Steering Committee must ensure that as many options as possible are reviewed before the administration embarks on a course of action.

When devising alternative strategies, some of the following options/ considerations might be taken into account:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Considerations internal to the administration</th>
<th>Sole occupancy or shared facilities</th>
<th>Growth potential</th>
<th>New construction or renovation of existing structures</th>
<th>Distressed real estate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recreational facilities</td>
<td>Availability of support staff, student density and transportation</td>
<td>Proximity to hotels</td>
<td>Environment conducive to learning (surroundings, noise, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Considerations external to the administration</td>
<td>Availability and condition of utilities</td>
<td>Zoning regulations</td>
<td>Community acceptance</td>
<td>Proximity to other Important services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Step 5: Specification of functional characteristics of spaces

The functional specifications of a building determine its functional characteristics: each space must be defined in detail with its functional specifications.

A complete list of all the activities that will be handled in each space must be compiled prior to the architectural design. This requires a detailed knowledge of each activity: e.g. role-plays in simulated work environments, e-learning sessions, research, group work, etc.

### Step 6: Design of training space

The design of space is a technical matter that requires professional skills. However, the Steering Committee must acquaint itself with some of the concepts:

• Operational relevance
• Flexibility and adaptability
• Activity space layout
• Determination of space requirements and room sizes.

Moreover, some specific elements, such as security and diversity issues, are based on the administration’s policy.

### Step 7: Estimation of the cost of space and furnishings

The cost per unit area of training space depends on several factors. Likewise, the cost of furniture and furnishings depends on many variables, which include type and quality. These factors are decided as a matter of policy, depending on the budget available and the life expectancy of the training facility.

Once again, an architect or other expert must be consulted when this costing is being made as it is on this basis that the final proposals to management will be made.

### Step 8: Narrowing choices and making detailed proposals

A concise but detailed proposal must then be produced by the Steering Committee to efficiently inform the decision-making process. It is important that the proposal is properly drafted to ensure that the most beneficial options are chosen.

After the extensive analysis, the Steering Committee is responsible for defending the proposals and justifications to top management.
The Korea Customs Service has been implementing a new 3-stage Training Strategy which redefines its Customs Border Control Training Centre (CBCTC) as an Experiment-Based Training hub which will:

- Improve organizational productivity;
- Enhance field adaptability of officials;
- Enabled first-hand experience of customs operation by clients;
- Utilize for training of foreign customs officials as WCO RTC; and
- Contribute to customs modernization of developing countries.

The establishment of a Strategic Customs Training Center enables the reproduction of scenes of arrival/departure, in/export clearance, etc.; owed to the utilization of experiential learning and simulations.

The plans below show the specific arrangements foreseen for the new CBCTC simulation complex.
3.3. Develop Quality Training Programmes

Designing a training programme or scenario involves articulating the most efficient sequence to develop the audience’s competence and to deliver the programme and then developing all the training materials necessary to conduct the training.

The process is set out in the steps described in this section. In this section, a course or programme does not relate to one teaching method (such as a classroom session), but to a sequence of learning actions designed to meet the defined teaching objectives.

3.3.1. Development of Training Materials

Development Process: Step-by-Step

Step 1 - Review of the Competency Needs Analysis Report

The Competency Needs Analysis Report provides an indication of the nature and scope of the training required. The most important outputs of this report are typically:

- Task analysis data;
- Target population profile;
- Competencies required;
- Training objectives; and
- Recommendations on the required nature and scope of the training.

All these elements are used by the Training Framework, and hence by the training designer or design team, to design a course that will meet the training needs.

On the basis of these training objectives, the training methods can be decided, the sessions designed and the training plan organized. This is a decisive tool as far as the creation of a training strategy is concerned.

Step 2 - Development of a Course Structure

Once the training objectives have been determined, they must be ordered in the best logical sequence. That is, the sequence being the most meaningful to the trainee and which generates the most significant learning in the shortest period of time. The resultant product is the “Course Structure” within the Training Framework. Once the course type has been decided, the most appropriate framework for structuring the course must be selected. Each course, when considered in its entirety, has a characteristic combination of various functional, equipments or environmental conditions.

Below are various alternatives and possible structures, with examples of the type of courses:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Hardware    | a. Firearms handling  
b. Operating surveillance equipment  
c. Radio communications |
| Tasks       | a. Conducting baggage search  
b. Completion of seizure report  
c. Processing of vessel cargo  
d. Taking of fingerprints |
| Functions   | a. Logistics and supply  
b. Administration  
c. Research and development |
| Environment | a. Seaport manifest office  
b. Airport arrivals area  
c. Land border checkpoint |
| Proficiency levels | a. Basic training  
b. Advanced training |
| Knowledge areas | a. Import/export law  
b. Counter-drug smuggling  
c. Marine operations |
| Duty areas   | a. International airport  
b. International seaport  
c. International land border |
| Systems     | a. Marine support operation  
b. Air support operation  
c. Marine office |

1 Reference to the WCO Standard Operational Procedures on Training development and WCO Training packages templates (available on request).
Once a framework course structure has been determined, the next task consists in putting the training objectives into related groupings or clusters, associating the objectives with each cluster, and finally sequencing the clusters into an overall course structure.

Step 3 - Preparation of the Course Outline

A course outline is a broad but clearly defined outline of the main steps and activities which will constitute the course. This broad outline can be used as a basis for committing resources and developing working schedules for the design team. It typically includes the following elements:

- Rationale for the training course (a concise description of the problem or need giving rise to the training course, the general context in which the course will be conducted, its purpose and its benefits to the organization);
- Duration of training course;
- Description of the target population and the maximum and/or minimum number of participants;
- List of the training sessions or lessons and the main training objectives to be achieved in each;
- List and sequence of the appropriate teaching methods used and special training activities planned for the training programme, such as field trips, demonstrations, simulations, guest speakers, etc.;
- Timetable of points in time during the course when major evaluations of the progress of the participants will be conducted; and
- Estimates of human and other resources required to run the course (e.g. number of trainers and other resource persons, number and type of classrooms and other training rooms, equipment, documents, publications, and other training materials).

Step 4 - Approval of the Course Outline

The training course must be critically reviewed by subject-matter experts. It is also crucial at this stage that the approval of the client is obtained before proceeding with the design. It therefore follows that the course outline, whilst only the skeleton framework for the actual programme, must be sufficiently detailed for third parties to be able to see clearly how the final package will meet the identified training needs.

Step 5 - Review of Existing Material

The materials already available both internally and externally should be reviewed before resources are allocated to the development of new materials. Developing training material can be costly and time-consuming, and any duplication should be avoided.

Step 6 - Development of Trainers’ Handbook

The trainers’ handbook provides a mechanism whereby the design team can communicate to the trainer what the training course is about and how it is to be conducted. This reference material includes:

- An overview of the scope and limits of the training programme;
- Lesson plans;
- Guidelines on the use of the training material included or recommended in the package;
- Additional information that could assist the trainer in delivering the training, such as a glossary of technical terms, abbreviations, acronyms, etc. associated with the subject and/or work context; and
- A list of participants, including their experience and other relevant background information.

Step 7 - Development of Participants’ Handbook

The participants’ handbook usually contains the course outline (including training objectives), the list of participants, list of trainers and other administrative information required by the participants whilst at the training venue. Notes intended for the trainer should not be included in this handbook.

Step 8 - Development of Handouts and other Reference Material

Handouts and reference materials are technical or instructional documents which may not be appropriate for inclusion in the participants’ handbook. They are given separately to participants either before or during the training sessions. Handouts and other reference materials should not be distributed if they do not contribute to the attainment of the training objectives.

Step 9 - Production of Training Aids

Training aids are all items and facilities, including printed documents, equipment and technology, used to facilitate the communication of ideas, principles, concepts, facts, observations and all other information and data necessary to achieve the training objective(s). Categories of training aids include visual aids such as flip charts and samples, or multimedia aids.

Step 10 – Development of Assessments

Assessment development involves the following:

- Preparation of test question(s);
- Writing directives for the administration of the assessment and instructions for participants; and
- Preparation of scoring guidelines.
Assessments must always be based on the defined training objectives. The lesson plan should also be consulted to determine suitable evaluation points during the course when the assessments can be held.

**Step 11 - Validation and Approval of the Training Package**

Once again, the clients’ approval is necessary at this stage. The complete package should be submitted for examination and approval. Once approval is obtained, a pilot course should be conducted to confirm the effectiveness of the training programme. A validation report produced at the end of the pilot course will indicate any necessary modifications for completing the design phase, before the package is validated as the final product. Some templates regarding the development of course materials have been developed by the WCO Secretariat1 and are available upon request.

**Managing Course Development**

**The Scope of Course Development**

Several of the processes followed to this point collectively represent the elements of course development. The processes include analyzing performance requirements, identifying performance problems, developing training objectives and evaluation strategies and shaping these into a lesson plan. These processes can and should also be implemented where training programmes are already in place. In that case, the objective would be to improve these existing courses or adapt the ones developed elsewhere so that they correspond to local conditions. Course developers are often not the people who deliver the courses. However, it may be advisable for developers to conduct the first session of a course they have developed before handing it over to the trainers.

**Planning Course Development Projects**

Course development plans can be based on estimates of the number of days or weeks of instruction required for each training programme. The development of each course is best planned as a project, whose length can vary from a few weeks to as much as a year, depending on the size of the course in question. For quality control purposes, it is preferable to avoid projects larger than this, by dividing a bigger training task into several packages.

**Forecasting the Length of Course Development Projects**

A rough approximation of the length of a course development project can be derived from the length of the course itself. The course length roughly indicates the volume of course development work needed. The time required to develop courses of a given type and length could be estimated on a ratio which could vary from 3 to 5 hours of development for 1 hour of delivery.

---

1 Funded by the Swedish International Development Agency under the WCO-SIDA Columbus Phase II Sub-Saharan Africa.
Relations Between Course Developers and Operations

Although there may be arrangements for course developers to be assisted by subject-matter experts, a formal committee comprised of individuals who understand the need for training at various levels in the organization, should be set up to:

- Notify course developers of anticipated performance problems and their implications for training;
- Provide course developers with sources of data for study;
- Participate in the problem analysis process;
- Participate in decisions about courses of action, based on the study conclusions;
- Review plans for future course development projects;
- Review progress of course development projects and attempt to remove obstacles to progress; and
- Review the results of evaluation, e.g., assessment of trainee attitudes, attainment of course objectives and job performance, and to take action.

There are several advantages to having such a committee. For example, it helps ensure that the training reflects and meets the needs of field management and fully complies with training evaluation and organizational development requirements. It also helps ensure that non-training solutions recommended in the study report are acted upon, and promotes a harmonious relationship between training and the rest of the organization.

Qualities of a Course Developer

The job of course developer is not only highly demanding, but also requires diverse and somewhat conflicting skills. In the early stages of course development, developers must perform tasks that primarily involve analysis, e.g. when conducting training needs analysis. To do this effectively, they must suspend judgment until they have sufficient data to form the basis for valid conclusions. They must be analytically-oriented and tolerant of the involved in the early stages of analysis.

On the other hand, the later stages of course development (such as development of training objectives, evaluation instruments, training methods, etc.) require a different mindset which is not unlike that of an artist. Often, course developers are forced to find solutions in the absence of adequate data.

It follows from the above that a good course developer has to have analytical skills and an analytical approach, plus creative training-design skills which generally come only with experience and confidence. Some general qualities to look for are:

- analytic ability
- ability to find innovative solutions
- communications skills, both oral and written
- resourcefulness and tenacity in overcoming obstacles
- ability to establish rapport and obtain co-operation
- flexible and adaptable
- open-minded, receptive to new data even when it conflicts with long-held views.

New learning methods and automated tools may enable certain organizations to assign subject-matter experts to the course development.

Finland Customs has adopted a flatter training production scheme owed to its E-Learning programme which allows senior experts to develop e-courses directly on the organization’s Learning Management System (hosted on its intranet platform), and be responsible to monitor and tutor trainees later in the training process.

This model ensures more reactivity to training development (less resources, less time) and more relevance (direct link between the operational reality and the training scenarios).

Controlling the Course Development Effort

The Course Development Group as a whole may be monitored through regular reporting mechanisms, but the training manager should meet with team leaders frequently to review progress. There are some common pitfalls that the manager should be on the lookout for:

- The tendency to unnecessarily prolong work in any one stage. Course Developers may go overboard in gathering data, without properly assessing its usefulness, particularly in task analysis.
- The tendency to skip over prescribed procedures in development.
- Replacing conclusions based on valid data with personal biases and opinions, even when data are available.

3.3.2. Blending Innovative and Social Learning Approaches

This section provides guidance on selecting appropriate training approaches and delivery methods.

Selecting the most effective teaching methods to efficiently meet the teaching objectives of the course is part of the teaching design process described in the previous chapter.

The teaching techniques and methods must be blended throughout the training sequence, in the line with the specific objectives to be achieved:

- Acquisition of knowledge
- Development of skills
- Development of attitude
- Application by identification
- Application by simulation
- Adaptation to situations and to changes
- Application on the job.
There is a wide range of methods traditionally used by trainers and designed by course developers which is not tied to any specific location and which can, in fact, be off-the-job or on-the-job: lectures, debates, group work, case studies, role-plays, study trips, internships, simulation and experimental learning sessions, physical fitness and confidence building activities, etc.

In recent decades, cost-effectiveness has been a powerful impetus in the development of blended teaching methods. Moreover, on-the-job solutions have also proven a great success because of the priority which a performance-centred administration such as Customs must give to application and practicability.

The development of communication technologies and changes in the structure and culture of an effective work environment, have been accompanied by the emergence of new methods and techniques. Some of the main trends are:

- E-learning
- Tutoring
- Mentoring - Twinning
- Coaching
- Participative learning.

The aim of blending different approaches is to maximize the impact of training and better meet the learner’s specific needs. This approach is often called blended-learning or b-learning.

**E-learning and B-learning**

The e-learning solution offers a wide variety of innovative educational methods, as well as some ideal alternatives to traditional methods. Used together, they can optimize the effectiveness of training very swiftly. The interactivity of the e-learning content improves learning performance by involving the trainees in the process. E-learning offers training managers and courses developers different types of possibilities. Customized use of this complementary training method by training management will create opportunities to enhance on-the-job training strategy. It will also achieve tangible results, allowing uniform training to extend throughout the administration, independently of the geographic, economic or structural constraints.

**Challenges of E-learning**

E-learning makes training more accessible to trainees. It impacts on the sustainability and accuracy of training materials as it is easily updated and upgraded. It makes the e-learning format very suitable for delivering content which, by its nature, is subject to change, and it allows updates to reach the trainees more quickly, with less cost for the organization.

In addition, e-learning provides the organization with a flexible tool, having the potential for limitless dissemination and immediate set-up and results, in exchange for a transparent and one-off investment. The cost efficiency of e-learning has proved to be best when:
• the Administration needs to train, in a short time, a lot of people who are widely spread across the territory (e.g. when there is a major organizational or procedural change); or when

• the Administration needs to allow its staff to access training courses on demand, on a continuous basis.

This type of training is available whenever the trainee needs it, without the organization having to tie staff down to particular times. Such ease of access promotes what is sometimes known as «opportunity learning»: an employee may need «micro-training» in a specific subject for his or her work, without necessarily being able to wait for a full session or needing lengthy training. With quick and easy access to the e-learning modules which can be arranged in a modular and adapted way, employees can put together a mini training course on the subject(s) which interest(s) them. Finally, the fact that trainees are monitored throughout the training process provides personalized support which helps to ensure the training’s success.

Blending e-learning with traditional teaching methods

Blending the e-learning with traditional teaching is one of the most effective uses of blended learning methods. Implementing this additional approach can dramatically impact on the organization overall, as it maximizes opportunities for on-the-job training and creates a continuous learning process for the practical establishment of knowledge-based administration.

The objective is to remove from the classroom everything that the trainees are capable of assimilating for themselves, so that the trainers can really add value during the face-to-face sessions. This requires a truly proactive approach from trainees before the classes, which is promoted widely by the cultural shift toward learning organization.

Training offer and learning methods are being more service-oriented in the commercial sense of the term, where flexibility and availability are provided by trainers (e-learning tutorship and hotline approach) vis-à-vis trainees who are becoming increasingly demanding and responsible of defining their learning needs. There are different timeframes for combining e-learning with traditional classroom training. Each course can be preceded by a session to evaluate the level of the trainee.

This option makes it possible to identify the programme best suited to each trainee and thus increase the programme’s effectiveness: it identifies in advance anyone who has not reached the required pre-training level and provides an opportunity for bridging knowledge gaps before further training resources are committed. E-learning can also be used after a session in order to help overcome one of the training challenges: long-term evaluation or to allow learners to continue benefitting from a training platform to refresh learning or to make the transition between two levels of training programmes. The trainer can also use an e-learning module to give a demonstration during the teaching session.

Examples:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Timeframe</th>
<th>1st example (e-learning upstream)</th>
<th>2nd example (e-learning downstream)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Before Classroom Session</strong></td>
<td>Distance training for the trainees’ group, assisted by a tutor (prior to the training session).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **During Classroom Session** | Meeting in a classroom session with trainer:  
  • Debriefing and perfect the e-learning (Q/A based on the group’s e-learning achievements).  
  • Practical work revolving around case studies/simulation: the classroom course level is raised. | The trainees follow a classroom course.                                                              |
| **After Classroom Session** | The trainees have two weeks to register, if they wish, onto distance training modules covering the same subject from a different perspective. | Organizing a test relating to the course as a whole (face-to-face + distance training).       |

1 See Annex 12: Best practice from Member implementing an e-learning platform
The Finnish Customs Administration has systematically integrated e-learning and blended learning methods into its Training delivery models for all the training targeted to Customs officers with operative tasks who have not completed the basic vocational training earlier.

Each course begins with a period of online guided independent studies, followed by a period of contact teaching. The contact teaching period focuses on the main themes of the online learning material, reviewing the key topics, and goes deeper into the things already learned. Depending on the course, the contact teaching period is followed either by an on-the-job learning period or by another period of online guided independent studies. Except for the course “Classification of goods”, each course ends with an on-the-job learning period, the aim of which is that the students deepen and practice their theoretical knowledge and skills in practical work.

The learning contents of the courses are based on what the students are to know after completing the course in question, e.g. the things taught and learned during the lessons are derived from the aims of the contact teaching periods. The courses are created in such way that together they form a coherent and logical learning entity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>Delivery Method</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tax</td>
<td>Classroom / Distance Learning</td>
<td>49.5 Days / 47 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customs</td>
<td>Classroom / Distance Learning</td>
<td>34 Days / 100 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
<td>15 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMS – Ops Technical</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
<td>9 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systems – Tax</td>
<td>Classroom</td>
<td>7 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Integration – Taxes</td>
<td>On the job</td>
<td>70 Days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Integration – Customs</td>
<td>On the job</td>
<td>60 Days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The South African Revenue Service (SARS) has implemented a course aimed at developing the competencies of its operational managers. This course made of several modules conducted over one year, uses various training methods and classroom training only represents 22% of the overall course duration. The other methods involved include e-learning, on-the-job training and tutoring.
Social Learning and other Learning Approaches

Mentoring – Twinning - Coaching

These three training methods first appeared in Anglo-Saxon universities and high-school. They are aimed at developing learners by having them gain the necessary knowledge and skills in a supported way. They involve a developmental relationship between two persons.

Rather than simply giving the answers, the trainer’s role should be to help the learner discover the answers for him/herself. In these developmental schemes, the trainers need to facilitate the experience of discovery and learning. The trainer’s role is to help the learners discover their own true self and experience their own attempts, failures and successes and, by so doing, to develop their own natural strengths and potential.

The difference between the methods lies in the person that supports the learner, as shown in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of relation</th>
<th>Profile of the “learning partner”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring</td>
<td>The mentor has more professional experience than the learner in the field that he is to “teach”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>The coach does not necessarily have experience of the learner’s professional field, but will help him/her to develop in his/her job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twinning</td>
<td>The twin is usually a person at the same level as the learner, but from another organization. For example, it may be somebody from a parallel organization in another country, or somebody doing the same job in a different organization.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In any event, it is important, as in the case of other types of training actions, to establish training objectives, create schedules and hold regular assessments in order to benefit fully from these kinds of programmes.

Tutoring

Tutoring can refer to the same kind of relationships, as those indicated in the previous paragraph, but within an online training environment. The tutor has an educational role, a social support/group development role, a managerial role and, usually to a lesser extent, a technical support role.

Online tutoring implies a self-motivated and independent learner. Learning is the key focus of the process, as opposed to teaching. E-moderating usually refers to group online or web-based learning that:

- Is based on constructivist and social-constructivist principles;
- Focusses on utilizing online dialogue and peer learning to enrich learning within the online environment; and
- Focusses on achieving goals of independent learning, learner autonomy, self-reflection, knowledge construction, collaborative or group-based learning, online discussion, transformative learning and communities of learning, as opposed to delivering online content via a transmission mode.

In a full online training environment, the role of the tutor is crucial as this person will be the only reference for the trainee and will guide him/her through the learning process.

Participative and Social Learning

The concept of participative learning is not new and is often used by training developers and trainers. It is based on the idea that trainees can learn not only from the trainer, but also from and with each other, sharing their experiences and building their knowledge through the experiences of others. However, integration of new technologies in managing the learning process has enabled to widely foster the impact of collaboration applied to learning within communities of professionals.

The methods often traditionally for participative learning in a classroom environment are group discussions, case studies, group exercises, etc.

Nevertheless, the development of Web 2.0 and the expansion of e-learning have created new tools for the use of participative training methods in the online environment. When integrated on the e-learning platform, these tools may complement the e-learning courses very effectively by offering a blend of methods that help the students acquire knowledge and skills in greater depth.

Among these tools, some could be listed, without being exhaustive:

- Wikis: these could be defined as online open encyclopaedias to which each participant can contribute and in which each can write articles, based on their own knowledge and experience.
- Forums: these are online message boards where participants can share their views on different subjects, or ask for suggestions from other participants when facing a problem. It is advisable for a moderator (the tutor or the trainer) to monitor the forums in order to guide discussions and answer the most difficult problems.
- Blogs: these are online journals where participants can express themselves in an individual or collaborative way. They may reflect the development, doubts and achievements of learners during their training.
The Social Learning aims at creating communities of practice anchored by discussions, file sharing, and wiki activities. It enables the organizations to drive “wisdom of crowds” strategies e.g. through ratings and reviews on process, procedures for example. The organizations shall design learning and knowledge portals that combine formal courses, use-generated content, and communication channels to offer their workforce a single focal point for learning. New processes can enhance collaboration and further connection with partners, customers, and alumni through social networking and integrated virtual collaboration/communication tools such as web conferencing, webinars, etc.

More organizations actively promote innovative and participative thinking amongst their staff in their delivery programmes, systematic analytical work and down-to-top reporting.

All the Finnish Customs’ training programmes for operational staff require the trainee to develop a final project. The aim of the final project is to support students in their learning, to develop their own work and the work processes of their work communities as well as to develop their written communication skills. An important aim is to encourage innovation and discussion on how to develop work throughout Finnish Customs: to take a stand on the development suggestions that have been made and to make action plans for possible further measures.

At the concluding session, each student gives a short account of his or her own final project, its aims, points of departure and any suggestions for further measures. During the session, the students and the representatives of different functions in the Customs district discuss topics that have been raised.

The Scheme hereabove shows how blending the different training formats and methods can effectively participate in establishing a continuous learning environment.

3.4. Evaluate and Assess Training

Investment in training typically aims to develop required know-how, increase skill levels and assure compliance. However far too many training initiatives fail to effectively deliver for two main reasons:

1. No measurement to show the recipient actually learnt and retained the new information;

2. No measurement or correlation between the training delivered and sustained performance improvement at an individual, team or enterprise level.

Too often Training departments or centres are so busy delivering against the immediate and urgent objectives to assure ‘compliance’ or deliver on-boarding training, that they fail to consider their contribution to performance improvement or in supporting the longer term business strategy that may require a labour pool of different skills and capabilities. Therefore it is essential that training departments incorporate a systematic and continuous ‘assessment methodology’ in their strategy and into each of their initiatives.

The Training strategy, plans and events must have clearly targeted aims before the implementation stage is reached. Establishing the evaluation process constitutes a fundamental step, as this will enable the necessary milestones to be included in the schemes implementing the training strategy, thereby efficiently contributing to the administration’s development and change management.
3.4.1. Core Components of the Training Evaluation

What is evaluation?

Training evaluation is the process of identifying how successful a training effort has been. This involves collecting and analyzing information to determine the benefits or not of the training effort and making decisions about the future.

Why evaluate?

Evaluation is important for the following reasons:

- It provides the opportunity to demonstrate that training was worthwhile and has achieved its objectives;
- It provides feedback to the administration about the return on the training investment;
- It provides information to help improve future training;
- It can encourage the involvement of line managers in training and staff development matters;
- It provides trainees with a framework with which they can measure their competence;
- It can be used to compare internally and externally provided training; and
- It can form part of a larger survey of operational effectiveness.

Who evaluates?

All the actors involved in the training chain have different responsibilities in the evaluation process. These actors are namely:

- Senior management;
- The trainer;
- Line management;
- The training manager; and
- The trainee.

How to evaluate?

Before embarking upon the implementation of a systematic and continuous learning evaluation methodology, a few elements should be considered:

- Securing commitment from the relevant stakeholders is fundamental. The organization has to collectively agree and have a firm resolve in implementing an adapted evaluation scheme and plan based on its specific needs;
- Being value-aware. Shifting from a cost-aware to a value-aware planning will ensure identification of the learning and training organizational qualitative gains within Customs administrations. All the value generated by Customs learning all the forms of that value, not just economic or financial—should be identified against the organization’s mission and the government’s agenda. It will then enable deciding whether and how to measure it: from a situational view, the pertinent evaluation techniques could be chosen on the basis of the Customs operating and strategic needs.

3.4.2. Training Effectiveness and Performance Assessment

One of the most popular evaluation models is the Kirkpatrick (see the graph hereabove) evaluation scheme which consists of four levels

### LEVEL 1
**REACTION**
- Engagement
- Relevance
- Customer satisfaction

### LEVEL 2
**LEARNING**
- Knowledge
- Skills
- Attitude
- Confidence
- Commitment

### LEVEL 3
**BEHAVIOR**
- Monitor & Adjust

- LEVEL 3 RESULTS
  - Leading indicators
  - Desired outcomes

- LEVEL 4
  - Encourage
  - On-the-job learning
  - Reward

Source: Kirkpatrick Partners, LLC, 2010

---

1. Annex 13: Description of the four levels of the Kirkpatrick’s evaluation model (including examples of evaluation tools and methods, and relevance and practicability).
This might result from a dichotomy of beliefs of the ultimate purpose of training and learning: the difference between believing it is to deliver ‘effective training’ (training giving the participants the intended knowledge, skills and/or attitudes to be able to perform the critical behaviours on the job), rather than believing to create and demonstrate ‘training effectiveness’ (training and subsequent reinforcement / monitoring that together deliver the desired organizational results).

An expanded working definition of Level 3 can provide the Customs National Training Centres with the missing link in the chain of evidence, showing the value of training as well as increasing the contribution of training to the bottom line.

A straight-forward step-by-step plan for implementing Level 3 in the Customs training initiatives could be defined as followed:

Step 1: Identify the Critical Behaviours

The first step is to accurately determine which behaviours are the ones that will most likely lead to the achievement of the targeted Level 4 outcomes. This can be done by talking to the managers and supervisors of those who will be trained.

Example: if the desired outcome is a 10% increase in customers’ satisfaction, Customs managers could identify the following critical behaviours:

• One same account manager per AEO company is responsive for any concerns until it is expressed that all concerns have been resolved satisfactorily;

• A supervisor on duty is immediately accessible to receive any passengers’ complaint;

• The suggestions posted in the ideas box to improve the service available to all Customers are acknowledged within two business days; and

• Customs officers greet all passengers when controlling the travel documents.

Step 2: Set Up Required Drivers

Setting up Level 3 required drivers (processes and systems that monitor, reinforce, encourage or reward performance of critical behaviours on the job) is essential to provide both support and accountability for training recipients to perform the critical behaviours on the job.

Example:

• Drivers that provide support: job aids, helpdesks coaching, mentoring, incentives and recognition, refresher training;

• Drivers that increase accountability: monitoring action plans, tracking individual performance indicators, cascade training/teach backs to colleagues.

Personal responsibility and internal motivation are expected to be greatly promoted throughout this process.

Step 3: Teach the Critical Behaviours in Training

Training must be conducted with a particular focus on the end goal which is to equip participants to perform the critical behaviours on the job so the highest possible level of organizational results is achieved.

Skills practice and simulations must be included to make sure they not only know what they are supposed to do, but have had some practice in actually doing it.

Step 4: Monitor and Measure Performance of Critical Behaviours on the Job

Monitoring and measuring Level 3 behaviour does not need to be difficult or expensive. A variety of methods are available to fit any organization and budget:

• Observing training participants;

• Surveying participants, supervisors, direct reports, peers and/or customers;

• Reviewing actual work output; and

• Conducting interviews and focus groups.

Step 5: Make Adjustments Based on the Data

Continually monitoring and measuring Level 3 behaviours and drivers will allow you to make tactical adjustments to your plan to ensure that on-the-job application is occurring.

Monitoring on-the-job application will also give you needed data to show if the training was effective. If training participants can show how to perform a critical behaviour but they aren’t performing it on the job, the problem is not related to the training; it might be linked to the work environment.

The Canada Border Services Agency has articulated its reviewed Officer Induction Training Program around an articulated Performance Measurement approach.

The performance evaluation of its Induction training continuum program is based on industry standards and measured through the quality and relevancy of its component. It will be monitored with a focus:

1- Performance of the candidates during:
   - Recruitment process,
   - Residential component,
   - Probation period.

2- Flexibility and adaptability of the program to adjust in a timely fashion to the evolving roles and responsibilities of the CBSA Officer.

3- Effectiveness of the delivery methodology and its alignment to industry standards.
Implementing thorough Evaluation Methods: Reaching Performance Assessment

New evaluation methods are being increasingly used by public policy, including Customs, due to their efficiency and cost-effectiveness such as randomized controlled trials (RCTs). Progressively introduced to test the effectiveness of public policy interventions, this method offers wide assets to test effectiveness of training interventions – whether online, in the classroom, virtual or otherwise.

The training recipients increasingly request efficient training offer centered on their needs and learning experience to raise their performance; the training programmes and structures clients (the organization’s management, government, donors) demand rigorous and demonstrable proof of the effectiveness of training. Learning and development training structures must now provide some measure of demonstrable performance improvement or return on investment which is challenging.

RCTs allow you to compare the effectiveness of a new intervention against what would have happened if no training had been done on a random basis. It is both cost and resource-efficient, as long as a systematic approach is adopted regarding the evaluation contextualization, participants’ profiling and criteria setting.

The Korea Customs Service has been implementing RCTs on selected training programmes among selected trainees. It has enabled this administration’s Training Centre (CBCTC) to implement a result-based management approach to its training policy and to assess the trained staff’s behavioral change.

4. NATIONAL CUSTOMS CURRICULA

One of the crucial elements for National Training Centres is to design efficient national curricula for career-long training. National curricula showcase Customs competency-based training approaches and core elements.

There are different approaches to design Customs National Training programmes and curricula as for definition, methodology, trainees’ profile and duration of courses.

For example, if comparing the trainees’ profiles for the induction training programmes of three countries:

- China Customs has established a Customs College where high school graduates have to study in the college for three years to obtain a University degree.
- Indian Customs set a two-year course for University graduates, which includes On the Job Training.
- Japan Customs provides six months training for high school graduates and three months training for University graduates.

4.1. Career-Long Training Components

Based on the collected practices, Customs training programs components can be identified as followed.

To enhance Job-related Competencies and implement career-long learning approach, Customs Administrations put in to practice training programs which create more efficient and dynamic training scenarios on the basis of the career stage along the fundamental training road-mapping principles applied to their career development: exploration, basic learning, implementation, transfer, to enrichment.

Relations between Training and Career Development

Induction Training Programme

The main purpose of these courses is to introduce newly recruited officers to basic Customs procedures who will be assigned to work for the first time in the Customs Administrations. Core course components usually include:

- Structures, roles, values, ethics and functions of the administration; and
- Basic information about Customs Laws, procedures and practices, international agreements and conventions and the environment of Customs etc.

Although there are divergences in terms of length and content depth, it appears from the collected practices that induction programmes are mostly aiming to equip new recruits with a minimum set of competencies in order to take responsibility for completion of tasks and to adapt their own behaviours to circumstances:

• Knowledge of the essential principles of the Customs environment and regulations (facts, principles, processes and general concepts, in Customs processes and procedures and regimes) and IT systems;

• A range of cognitive and practical skills required to accomplish tasks and solve problems by selecting and applying basic methods, tools and information;

• Perform Customs duties with a certain degree of autonomy

Some individuals recruited based on specific competencies required, at the technical or management level, might not follow the same training programme but should benefit from an adapted induction.

The Induction Training Programme is often followed by a probation or trial period in-the-field.

A consistent and standardized approach to the trial period should be provided by supporting recruits throughout their initial on-the-job work and bridging the skills and competencies from the residential phase to real-life application and job performance.

In the Canada Border Services Agency, recruits are on assignment to regions until the developmental program (linked to probation period) is complete.

The trial period is designed:

• to provide consistent and continual supervision and feedback paired with specific training activities and formal assessments at regular intervals; and

• based on revised job performance standards for officers.

**Specialized and Expert Training**

These courses target Customs officers in need to acquire or enhance new competencies to sustain the organization performance and their own performance. They are part of the life-long learning process and can be delivered at different moment of the Customs officer’s career: at the appointment to a new position, to face change in procedures, legislation, etc., upon request or on a compulsory basis, etc.

Several distinctions can be made depending on the subject matter. Distinctions by technical area, function or operational mode and distinction of level of expertise can be made: basic level, intermediate level, advanced level. Refresher courses to reinforce the induction training or previous specialized training fall also under this category.

The specialized or professional training programmes are mostly aimed at equipping the officers to perform tasks associated with a specific function or operational mode. This could include:

• Comprehensive, specialized, factual and theoretical knowledge (for lower level) to an Expert knowledge (for advanced level) about Customs processes, procedures and regimes and an awareness of the boundaries of that knowledge;

• Comprehensive range of cognitive and practical skills required to develop creative solutions to abstract problems, to advanced skills, demonstrating mastery and innovation, required to solve complex and unpredictable problems in a specialized field of work or study and mentoring, coaching and training skills; and

• The capacities to undertake complex case work, assess the wider implications of case work, interact with stakeholders at the highest level, and perform systems audits.

Some courses being very specific and non-Customs related can be conducted by outsourced lecturers like languages, accounting, auditing, etc.

**Leadership and Management Development Training**

Leadership and management development mainly aims to achieve the following objectives:

• Contribute to creating organizations that can be more self-sufficient in their development, that can better anticipate and respond effectively to changes in the environment,
and that can better meet the organizational objectives set by their respective government;

- Identify and develop leaders that can and that can set a vision for the future and guide organizations through change;

- Develop managers that understand the Customs environment, its challenges and that can lead the development of solutions and their implementation;

- Develop managers that take responsibility for their area, that are accountable for the results, that understand how they contribute to the organizational vision, and that are proactive in achieving their assigned objectives;

- Develop managers that take responsibility for the people under their supervision and that are able to coach and develop them to increase their performance, satisfaction, and professionalism;

- Provide opportunities for managers to build networks and relationships internally, and acquire the skills to establish other partnerships with stakeholders.

In order to strengthen the organizational leadership and management capacity, an administration must take a multi-tier approach that has a sustained and holistic impact on its managers. Such an approach should include:

**Top Executive Development Programmes**

Such programmes should have a particular focus on developing the leadership capacity of top executives. These programmes can include a combination of:

- Formal structured sessions where executives are guided by professional coaches to strengthen a particular aspect of leadership based on a previous assessment to identify their weaknesses. A particular focus should also be placed on developing self-awareness;

- Periodic career placements (e.g. every 24 months) to occupy various positions that will allow executives to gain new experiences and develop their leadership capacity;

- Opportunities to exchange with other Customs leaders on broad Customs strategic issues, that will contribute to the visioning at the executive level; and

- Assigned mentor that can coach them and provide personal and professional advice to address specific challenges faced by the executive.

**Senior and Middle-Manager Development**

This could include:

- Formal training workshops where managers are exposed to modern management practices and during which they discover new tools to improve their own leadership capacity. A particular focus should also be placed on developing self-awareness;

- Formal training workshops to explain the managers’ responsibility in terms of people management and development, and during which managers acquire new skills to do so;

- Provision of coaching services to strengthen a particular aspect of leadership based on an assessment that has identified weaknesses;

- Lateral placement policies that allow managers to take on different responsibilities if they so wish; and

- Assigned coach or mentor for managers showing great promise to become senior managers or executives.
4. Customs Competency-Based Training Guidelines

Development of High-Potential Individuals

The following approach could be followed:

- Administration must first have mechanisms in place to identify high-potential individuals within their ranks;
- Once identified, these individuals should be given training and placement opportunities to develop their management skills and leadership capacity; and
- Administrations can also identify individuals with particular talent to take part in so-called “fast track” programmes, where participants are given challenging opportunities to learn through placement in progressively senior positions and management functions.

Front-Line Supervisor Training

This training should be part of the normal routine of the administrations to provide front-line supervisors with basic management and supervision techniques. Issues covered should include: time management, how to run meetings, delegation, understanding the role of the supervisor, and other issues specific to the administration regarding HR and administrative policies.

Train the Trainers Training

The improvement of trainers’ competence is crucial for National Training Centres to ensure quality Customs training activities and effective and uniform implementation of the National Training Programme. There is a need to develop trainer standards, motivation and trainer development programs to:

- Improve teaching and design abilities;
- Implement innovative teaching methods and tools; and
- Share modern training theory and training innovation etc.

International Training Programs

International Training Programs mostly based - on technical cooperation programs for the improvement of Customs administration and unification of a global customs system.

Whereas various international organizations, like the WCO and its network of Regional Training Centres, and regional communities are providing international courses, several Customs Administrations are opening their National Training Centres to Customs officers of other administrations: Burkina Faso, China, France, Japan, Malaysia, Morocco, etc. without the list being exhaustive.

4.2. Customs Curricula: National Practices

The Framework’s multimedia format provides access to the WCO Member Administrations’ latest practices and some complete curricula. It reveals both the worldwide common understanding of the Customs Profession’s core competencies and the various strategic approaches to Training, depending of the Administration’s history, values, legal status and mission.

Get connected to the People Development Interactive Map and access to a wide repository of Customs curricula, especially on National Induction Training and Basic Vocational Training Programmes of Administrations like Finland, Japan, Canada, Côte d’Ivoire, New Zealand, etc.

CONCLUSION

Future directions and recommendations to overcome some of the challenges and gaps identified have been drawn by some Administrations or can be taken from the experience of other organizations or the private sector.

Given the ever-evolving Customs environment, it appears essential that National training continuously foster innovation to raise training performance and find cost-effective solutions. Some approaches, tools and methods can be highlighted at both the policy and the operational levels.

Policy Level

- Strengthening international cooperation with other Administrations’ National Training Centres, Regional Training Centres and the WCO;
- Enhancing cooperation with other border agencies in a view to enhance coordinated border management and the establishment of a common language and understanding;
- Increasing exchange and cooperation with Universities and other learning institutes, as promoted by the WCO PICARD platform (the strategic relationships between Universities and Customs being emphasized at both national and international levels for Customs Education and Research);
- Promoting the Accreditation and Academic Recognition of Customs Professional Training

1 Accreditation of Training can be described as the mechanism which ensures that the overall quality of training is maintained at a high standard. It provides a form of guarantee to all users of an accredited training provider that the institution complies with set standards for learning and assessment. Accreditation notifies the general public that an institution or training programme meets the criteria set by a recognized local/regional/national/ international accrediting agency. It also consists of ongoing evaluation and program improvement.
Some Customs Administrations have already started to think how to integrate their ongoing Training Activities and Programmes to the Training recognized by the National Board of Education or any similar institution. It enables to raise the profile of their administrations by capitalizing on the portability and mobility of talents.

**Operational level**

- Enhancing the Customs training quality standards by sustaining training for trainers programmes and developing partnerships with external lecturers and professional trainers;

- Keeping on developing further simulation training, training on the operations field in a secured environment, and thinking the learning process as a continuous sequence throughout the career;

- Focusing training on the problem-solving competence for maximizing the operational capacities and agility of the workforce;

- Expanding use of innovative educational technologies and extending the learning experience to a continuous process: expanding the use of e-learning, adopting m-learning (using mobile devices) to closely accompany the Customs officers in the field; and

- Further integrating social learning platforms and community tools on the respective Customs’ intranet to promote collaborative learning and operationalize Knowledge Development and Management processes.

Customs Training aims at raising organizational performance through professional and personal development. It needs to follow a competency-based and results-based approach. The Training activities, focused on the implementation, strive to bridge the performance gaps (both at the individual and organizational levels) and promote the learners’ accountability to apply change within their work environment. Training and Development must be considered by the Customs Administration’s decision makers a strategy for change.

In order to adopt and develop a competency-based Training, some key elements are essential: the strategic alignment of Training and HR, the adoption of a Competency Framework, the constant analysis and the evaluation of Performance Gaps.
ANNEXES
ANNEX 1: Identification Of Strategic Relationships With Main Stakeholders

IDENTIFICATION OF STRATEGIC RELATIONSHIPS

A training manager must seriously consider his/her relationships with a number of stakeholders. This will enable him/her:

- to define and understand the role that training must play within his/her administration, and
- to develop strategies to ensure that it plays a central role and raise its profile.

It may be useful to refer to the Project Management chapter to learn more about the background, methods and general implications of the stakeholder analysis.

A fundamental starting point is to apply a simple audit method, examining the training manager’s environment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY PLAYERS</th>
<th>MAIN STAKEHOLDERS/QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Senior Managers/ Policy-Makers/Decsion-Makers | • Identification of actors and responsibilities  
• Drawing up the institutional vision  
• Values and beliefs to promote  
• Level of understanding of the core role of training within the Customs administration |
| Human Resources Management       | • Recruitment patterns and standards of the organization  
• Drawing up the Human Resources Development Strategy  
• Level of integration of training within human resources development and career development |
| External Agencies                | • Level of co-operation with other Government agencies such as the police, military, agriculture, etc.  
• Opportunities for joint programmes/resources |
| Trade Organizations              | • Perception of the administration                                                             |
ANNEX 2: Operational Plans Checklist

The operational training plans should include the following items:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operational training plans components</th>
<th>Elements to indicate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The specific training objectives</td>
<td>Define as clearly as possible to guide the training development and training assessment processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The target audience</td>
<td>The number of persons to be trained, divided into the target groups identified in the strategic plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The training methodology</td>
<td>The teaching methods to be used for each of the target groups, and each course’s sequence components</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The appropriate time required for the training</td>
<td>The timetable per sequence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The reference materials</td>
<td>The identification, and preparation and distribution timeline and responsibilities for the training materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The responsibilities for the training</td>
<td>The allocation of trainers to each training session/sequence, including agreements to entrust certain training responsibilities to third parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The training environment</td>
<td>The place where the training sessions will be held, provision for the renting of classrooms or equipment, where necessary, and the number of persons in each of the various training locations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The necessary arrangements for trainers and trainees</td>
<td>Travel and accommodation (when applicable), and means of communication for trainers and trainees, logistical arrangements for the distribution of training materials and equipment, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge testing</td>
<td>Methods and resources needed to test knowledge upstream; evaluation of training; the methods, time and resources needed to evaluate the uniformity and quality of the training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training assessment</td>
<td>Evaluation of the training success, plans for responding to emergencies/risks identified and plans to potentially meet the need for complementary forms of training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required resources for the operational training plans</td>
<td>Financial and personal resources required for delivering the training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 3: Training Needs Analysis Templates

### Task analysis for job:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key areas</th>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>Sub-Tasks</th>
<th>Importance (1 to 3)</th>
<th>Frequency (1 to 5)</th>
<th>Priority (importance + frequency)</th>
<th>Necessary Knowledge</th>
<th>Necessary Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
### Training needs analysis for job:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Develop and obtain approval for TNA Project Proposal</td>
<td>Define the strategy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine the proposed respondents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine methods of gathering data.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Designs all the tools necessary for the exercise, such as questionnaires, interview guidelines, etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Get senior management commitment for the realization of the training needs analysis.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Identify job duties and tasks</td>
<td>List the current job duties.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Job analysis</td>
<td>N.B. The job interview template may be used for this purpose.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the priorities or significant duties and activities (activities are such things as meetings, providing advice, etc.).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the most difficult aspects of the work, and why they are difficult.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the changes that are about to occur in the job.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the knowledge (or information) of a technical nature needed to perform the job satisfactorily, and the level of such knowledge (or information).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the knowledge, other than that of a technical nature, that helps with performing the job.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Specify the best way of obtaining all this knowledge.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the technical skills (or abilities) needed to perform the duties satisfactorily.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Specify the best way of obtaining all these skills.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the non-technical skills (administrative or people skills) needed to handle the various aspects of the job.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine if any team work is involved.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine how the job contributes to the team.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify any knowledge or skills needed to assist other team members.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Specify the best way of obtaining all the knowledge and skills.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine if any higher-level duties are performed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the knowledge and skills necessary to perform these duties.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Task analysis</td>
<td>Break down the job into key areas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Break down each key area into tasks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Break down each task into sub-tasks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Validate tasks and rank in order of priority</td>
<td>Validate the task analysis with the subject-matter expert or experienced officers in the job.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine the most important tasks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Determine the most frequent tasks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Deduce the priority tasks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Collect information/data on performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Review existing training materials.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Review any feedback available on that training.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Review job descriptions, manuals, policy statements or other work-related documents.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interviews with the target population, their supervisors, subject-matter experts and members of the Head Office functional area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Surveys of the target population, their supervisors and subject-matter experts (written or telephone).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Focus-group sessions where experts and/or the target population share knowledge and experience.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assess the current level of knowledge and skills of the target population with regard to the tasks identified.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>Select/analyse tasks selected for training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Select tasks for training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the tasks to be included in training. Tasks are selected for inclusion in training programmes for the following reasons:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is critical.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is essential to the performance of another task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Performance of the task is required immediately upon job entry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is difficult to learn and/or cannot practically be taught by OJT.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is performed often.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the tasks to be excluded from training. Tasks may be excluded from a training programme for the following reasons:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is similar to another task selected for training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is a prerequisite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task can be better learned on-the-job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The task is performed by a small percentage of jobholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Select tasks for training.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 5.2 | Analyse tasks for training |
|  | Identify knowledge and skills necessary to perform each sub-task corresponding to the identified tasks. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6</th>
<th>Describe target population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Describe the characteristics of the target population.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Describe the characteristics of the work environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identify the need for changes other than training.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7</th>
<th>Formulate training objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Write training objectives for each necessary knowledge and skill.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8</th>
<th>Write Training Needs Analysis Report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report the analysis to management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Propose training options to fulfil the training objectives.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Job Analysis Interview Guidelines

The following Job Analysis Interview Guidelines can be used for gathering information about specific jobs or groups of tasks performed by one person. Respondents to these questions may be officers who are either experienced and proficient in the job in question, or who wish to express their training needs. In both cases, the insight gained will be useful to the training needs analysis team.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What are your current tasks?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can you specify any tasks or activities (other than higher-level tasks) which are not listed in your job description but which you carry out either regularly or on an ad-hoc basis?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which of your tasks do you give the highest priority to and/or consider the most significant?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do you see as the most difficult aspect of your job? <em>(Give reasons for your answer)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are there changes about to occur in your job? <em>(If yes, give details)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looking at the tasks that you perform, what knowledge and/or information of a technical nature do you think you need in order to perform satisfactorily?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What knowledge and/or information, other than technical, helps you to do your job well?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the best way of obtaining all this knowledge and/or information?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What technical skills or abilities do you need for satisfactory performance?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where and/or how can you learn these skills or abilities best?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What non-technical (i.e. administrative or personal) skills do you think you need to help you handle various aspects of your job?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you work in a team and, if so, how do you see your job contributing to the team output?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What knowledge or skill do you possess that could benefit other team members? How did you obtain this knowledge or skill?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you perform tasks at a higher level and, if so, what knowledge or skills help you perform these tasks?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do you see as the most important form of training or development needed by a person in your post?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If someone were to transfer or be promoted to your post, what training would have to be provided immediately and what could be provided at a later time?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is there any other information you can offer to help with this analysis?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### ANNEX 4: Implementing E-Learning Best Practice Shared By WCO Member

#### Implementing an e-learning platform

**BEST PRACTICE SHARED BY A WCO MEMBER**

**THEMES AND TOPICS (IDENTIFY THE TOPIC(S) IN THE COMPRENDIUM)**

Training programmes

---

**BEST PRACTICE ABSTRACT OR EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Customs Administration plays an important role in implementing Government policies, as well as in achieving national development objectives. Often, Customs is the first window through which the external world perceives our country. Customs provides key persons/organizations involved in investment and foreign trade decision-making processes with their basic assumptions.

Without an efficient and well-trained Customs Administration, the Government cannot fully implement its policies on revenue collection, trade facilitation and trade statistics, or protect society against a large number of threats to social and national safety.

In accordance with Article 10 of the Customs Administration Law, the Customs Administration has the authority and responsibility for organizing and delivering training, for assessing the knowledge and professional capacities of its staff, and for introducing human resource management policies and systems.

The key to achieving this goal is to have a sustainable training strategy, Annual Training Plan and E-Learning Programme. The WCO e-learning platform is the best tool for achieving these goals.

---

**DESCRIPTION OF THE BEST PRACTICE**

- **(A) Background/brief history, including issues or problems**
  
  The training given to Customs officers in previous years may generally be described as disorganized, poorly planned and too theoretical, mainly because of the following:
  
  - absence of a defined training policy and system;
  - lack of co-ordinated training management processes between individual organizational units;
  - no recognition of business requirements and
  - budget limitations.

  There have also been cases when improvements in the quality of performance have had a lower priority than personal development. No criteria were developed to set training access requirements, and there were cases of non-compliance with the partially established criteria. Subjective decisions, which were not always based on real and identified needs, were also made.

  Furthermore, the understanding that all Customs officers should have equal access to training has proven unrealistic due to budget limitations. Much of the training was, and still is, financed by foreign sources. Training has therefore been based on supply, rather than on demand linked to thoroughly identified training needs.

  Training, as an essential element of the Administration's ongoing development and progress, finds its most important motive in the integration of the Customs Administration into the EU. The Customs Administration's European Partnership, as well as the Progress Reports on the Customs Administration country as part of its EU accession process, has set short and mid-term priorities in many areas, including public administration. For all areas of public administration, there is an explicit reference to the need to take measures to strengthen the Administration's capacity both locally and nationally, and to provide training to achieve the identified objectives.

- **(B) Action taken to improve the situation and solve the problems, including who is involved, how the process works, etc.**

  When a new approach to training is developed, an assessment should be made of the mandate of the key players in the process and of how that mandate can be exercised in practice. It is evident that significant efforts have been invested in training, both by foreign and national agencies. HR records can provide accurate information on the type of training delivered and by whom, the subjects covered, the training recipients and their number. However, they cannot give a clear picture of the effectiveness of the training.

  There have been cases when decisions on foreign training and study trips were made ad-hoc, with such training considered a privilege, rather than a long-term instrument which is necessary for individual/organizational work and which is linked to the needs of the organization or established individual needs. There have been cases when participants were sent inappropriate on training which had no relevance to the post, and when there was no evaluation of the training's effectiveness/outcome or of its value to the Administration.

  The reason for this is that decision-making rested with individuals who did not manage the aforementioned records and had no access to them. The training selection procedures therefore tended to be subjective and, in some cases, persons who had attended several cycles of training had been replaced.
In conclusion, it is vital that training is co-ordinated more effectively and that the development of own capacities and priorities continues.

The training strategy of the Customs Administration responds in an efficient and timely manner to the needs of society. Customs officers must gain the necessary new skills and knowledge – for instance, skills on provision of advice (creation of policies and procedures) and performance (executing policies and procedures). Managers must play an important role in:

- analysis-based policy design;
- coherent co-ordination of policies and procedures;
- information gathering and management;
- strategic management of the service;
- development of user-oriented services – strategic orientation;
- development of partnerships and team working;
- emphasis on standards, such as Customs officers’ integrity;
- prevention and fight against corruption;
- transparent public accountability;
- public relations.

In 2006, the Customs Administration adopted an E-Learning Programme, based on the Strategy for Training and Professional Development of Customs Officers. The reason for this was the need for more tailored training, more participants in training, for modern and interactive technologies, and for a better allocation of resources and cost benefits.

The best solution to this problem was to introduce the WCO e-learning modules on a national platform, to be hosted on the Customs Administration server, in order to improve access and the ability to modify the modules. After consultation, we received a very positive reply from the WCO Secretariat and the roll-out mission took place in June 2008. The WCO e-learning modules are very useful, easy to access and very interactive. For the Customs Administration, the biggest challenge has been to translate them into the relevant language. So far, several modules have been translated into the relevant language, others are in English, but the process of translation is ongoing.

- **(C) Result – benefits**

  Initial results are very positive. The WCO e-learning modules are widely accepted by Customs officers. They have more time to access the training modules individually and there is also the possibility of running special training courses based on the needs and assessment of Central Headquarters. The Guideline Manual has been translated into the relevant language and every Customs officer can access the WCO e-learning platform via the Customs Administration intranet page.

  Tutors and administrators can monitor the progress of participants by checking the time spent on learning, the results, and the average time and results achieved. We believe that the WCO e-learning modules provide significant opportunities for increasing the administrative capacity of the Customs Administration.

- **(D) Lessons learnt – success criteria/constraints/problems**

  During 2008, the Customs Administration significantly increased its administrative capacity, achieving an average 4 days of training per Customs officer. The broader implementation of the WCO e-learning modules in 2009 will further increase this number. The introduction of the e-learning modules gained the Customs Administration of the country the “Best Governance” award from among the whole public administration.

- **(E) Current and future action – project and plan, if any**

  The Customs Administration plays an important role in implementing Government policies and in achieving national development objectives. Without an efficient and well-trained Customs Administration, the Government cannot fully implement its policies on revenue collection, trade facilitation and trade statistics, or protect society against a large number of threats to social and national safety.

  The Training and Professional Development Strategy is a practical response that identifies and detects the training needs of Customs officers and of the business community. The future efforts of the Customs Administration will focus on successful training delivery. Successful implementation depends on all Customs officers being fully committed to the practical application of the principles and actions proposed in the E-Learning Programme and in the WCO e-learning modules.
## ANNEX 5: Kirkpatrick Four Levels Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Evaluation Type</th>
<th>Evaluation Description and Characteristics</th>
<th>Examples of Evaluation Tools and Methods</th>
<th>Relevance and Practicability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1     | REACTION        | How the learners felt, and their personal reactions to the training or learning experience, i.e.:  
|       |                 | • Interest/relevance  
|       |                 | • Good use of their time/level of effort required  
|       |                 | • Appreciation of the venue, style, timing, domestics, etc  
|       |                 | • Level of participation  
|       |                 | • Practicability perception and potential for applying the learning  
|       |                 | • Typically ‘happy sheets’  
|       |                 | • Feedback forms based on subjective personal reaction to the training experience  
|       |                 | • Verbal reaction which can be noted and analysed  
|       |                 | • Post-training surveys or questionnaires  
|       |                 | • Online evaluation or grading  
|       |                 | • Subsequent verbal or written reports given by trainees to managers back at their jobs  
|       |                 | • Can be done immediately when the training ends  
|       |                 | • Very easy process to gather or to analyse for groups  
|       |                 | • Important to know that people were not upset or disappointed  
|       |                 | • Important that people give a positive impression when relating their experience to others who might be deciding whether to experience same |
| 2     | LEARNING        | Measurement of the increase in knowledge or intellectual capability from before to after the learning experience:  
|       |                 | • Teaching objectives met  
|       |                 | • Relevance  
|       |                 | • Extent of advancement or change in the trainees after the training, in the direction or area that was intended?  
|       |                 | • Typically assessments or tests before and after the training  
|       |                 | • Interview or observation before and after (but time-consuming and can be inconsistent)  
|       |                 | • Methods of assessment closely related to the learning aims  
|       |                 | • Measurement and analysis easy on a group scale  
|       |                 | • Reliable, clear scoring and measurements  
|       |                 | • Hard-copy, electronic, online or interview style assessments are all possible  
|       |                 | • Relatively simple to set up,  
|       |                 | • Highly relevant and clear-cut for certain training such as quantifiable or technical skills  
|       |                 | • Less easy for more complex learning such as attitudinal development  
|       |                 | • Cost escalates if systems are poorly designed, which increases work required to measure and analyse |
### 3. BEHAVIOR

Implementation of the learning and change of behaviour, (immediately and/or several months after the training situation):

- Noticeable and measurable change in the activity and performance
- Change in behaviour and sustainability of the new level of knowledge
- Transfer of learning to another person

- Observation and interview over time to assess change, relevance of change, and sustainability of change
- No arbitrary snapshot assessments
- Subtle and ongoing assessments transferred to a suitable analysis tool
- Consistent design process, criteria and measurements
- Relevant performance scenarios, and specific key performance indicators
- 360-degree feedback is useful method after training

- Measurement of behaviour change, evaluation of implementation and application are difficult to quantify and interpret but vital for the organization
- Need of a well-designed system
- Line-managers and trainees must be involved and support the process

### 4. RESULTS

Effect on the business or environment resulting from the improved performance of the trainee measures typically business or organizational key performance indicators:

- Many of these measures already in place via normal management systems and reporting
- Challenge of identifying what is related to the trainee’s input and influence
- Identify and agree accountability and relevance with the trainee at the start of the training, so they understand what is to be measured
- Failure to link to training input type and timing will greatly reduce the ease by which results can be attributed to the training
- Measuring business results derived from training through annual appraisals, ongoing agreement of key business objectives

- Challenges of a results evaluation for an entire administration: reliance on line-management, and frequency and scale of changing structures, responsibilities and roles, etc. Complex process of attributing clear accountability
- Organizational and business performance affected by external factors, which cloud the linkage with training
Human Resource Development and Training are key to build Customs Performance from the Ground Up.